

Teaching Practice of Primary School Malay Language Teachers in Basic Reading Skills: A Literature Review

Hasni Yaacob, Syar Meeze Mohd Rashid

Faculty of Education, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia

Corresponding Author Email: cikgumeeze@ukm.edu.my

To Link this Article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARPED/v13-i3/22265>

DOI:10.6007/IJARPED/v13-i3/22265

Published Online: 20 August 2024

Abstract

Quality of instruction is important in determining a student's achievement in mastering a skill learned. Quality teachers must have high skills in content knowledge and pedagogical knowledge including teaching strategies. Therefore, this study aims to review the literature related to teachers' teaching practices in an effort to improve the level of mastery of basic reading skills among students at the primary school level. The review involved an analysis of previous studies that focused on teaching strategies and teaching aids used by teachers. The results of the analysis of 31 previous studies using the Scopus, WoS and Google Scholar databases have identified several best practices that can be used as a guide for teachers in improving teaching practices. The results of this literature review are expected to provide a comprehensive view of teachers' practices in teaching basic reading skills to low-achieving students in Malay Language subjects involving remedial students, students with special educational needs and Orang Asli students. Teachers' teaching practices have implications for the quality of instruction in line with the requirements of the Malaysian Teacher Standards and student achievement in the Malaysian Education Development Plan 2013-2025. Therefore, the professional development of teachers through continuous training plays an important role in ensuring that quality of instruction can be implemented to contribute to improving the quality of education in Malaysia.

Keywords: Basic Reading Skills, Teaching Practice, Remedial Education, Special Education.

Introduction

Globally, mastery of literacy skills is a key focus in the determination of the fourth Sustainable Development Goal by 2030 (United Nation, 2021). Of the four components of literacy, reading skills are one of the basic skills that children need to master. Reading skills need to be mastered by children to master other skills in various disciplines of 21st century learning (Mahzan, 2022; World Bank, 2024). This is important because mastery in reading skills is closely related to the level of achievement in academics (Abd Ghani et al., 2020; Abella et al., 2024; World Bank, 2024). In addition, a good mastery of reading skills will be a catalyst for

children to understand the more complicated learning process in school. On the other hand, children who do not master reading skills at an early age will have long-term effects on them in the future (Abbas, 2021; Grotlüschen et al., 2020; Roser, 2024). Among the long-term effects in individuals who are not proficient in reading are social problems, high unemployment rates, and poverty (Arenius, 2024; Nordheim & Huijts, 2023).

In Malaysia, in an effort to improve the quality of education in the country, the quality of teachers and the development of students are the two main targets of the Malaysian Education Development Plan 2013-2025 (PPPM) (KPM, 2013). Teacher quality is an important aspect in ensuring that education is delivered effectively to determine the most optimal student achievement (World Bank, 2024; KPM, 2023a) to achieve the top third position in international standards. Quality teachers have high skills in teaching practices including teaching methods (World Bank, 2024). This is important because quality of instruction is closely related to the level of mastery of reading skills among students (KPM, 2013). Students' success is measured by academic achievement based on the minimum level of proficiency in classroom assessment (PBD). In order to achieve student success, students' mastery in reading skills must be at the maximum level. However, based on the PBD report as of March 2023, there are 6.03 per cent or a total of 117,656 students out of 1,948,975 level one students who have not reached the minimum level of proficiency in Malay language (Dewan Negara Malaysia, 2023; KPM, 2023b). In addition, 12 percent of fifth-year students do not master basic reading skills and only 58 percent of fifth-year students are proficient in reading (World Bank, 2024). This situation shows that the level of ability of pupils in mastering reading skills will not only affect their academic achievement but will also affect their quality of life in the future.

Therefore, in an effort to improve the mastery of reading skills, teachers need to have high pedagogical skills. Teachers who are skilled in pedagogy will implement quality of instruction and thus improve student achievement (Ambotang & Anuar, 2023; KPM, 2023; Said et al., 2023). In addition, quality of instruction will be a catalyst for students to master reading skills at a rapid pace (Ismail et al., 2024; Pitoyo, 2020). This means that quality of instruction teaching practices have a significant influence on improving student achievement (Abella et al., 2024; Ghani et al., 2022; Nur Syamira & Harun 2021; Savitry & Norasmah 2022). Quality of instruction teaching practices include the use of various teaching aids and tools (Ching & Nurfaradilla, 2021; Wan Nurzuliana, 2019) to increase students' motivation, interest and concentration (Mohd Rohiman et al., 2021; Slavin, 2009). This situation makes students' learning more active and enjoyable and increases students' ability to remember what they have learned (Cheng & Mohamad Nasri, 2022; Mat Isa & Mahamod, 2021). Therefore, this literature review aims to explore and discuss the concept of quality of instruction and teaching practices in basic reading skills of Malay Language.

Quality of Instruction

There are two earliest models that talk about quality of instruction practices. Among them is the Carroll Model or also known as A Model of School Learning introduced by John Carroll (1963). The Carroll model outlines five factors that affect the teaching and learning process, namely the ability of students to learn (aptitude), ability to understand instruction, perseverance which is the willingness of students to spend time actively involved in the learning process (perseverance), opportunity which is the time available for learning

(opportunity) and the quality of teaching, which is the effectiveness of delivering a lesson (quality of instruction). This means that if students have a positive attitude towards learning, then it will be easier for students to understand the teaching, students will study diligently and then it will be easier to understand a concept and skill. Similarly, if a teacher's teaching is of good quality, then students will learn more easily.

Subsequently, Slavin (1995; 2009) introduced the QAIT Model or the Effective Teaching Model modified from the Carroll Model (Huitt, 2000; Tanase, 2020) for the weakness factor of the model. Based on the QAIT Model, quality of instruction means that teachers are able to convey lessons such as concepts or skills to students in a way that is easy to understand, easy to remember and enjoyable. Therefore, a quality teacher will deliver the content of the lesson in a structured manner, using simple language, clear explanations by providing relevant examples, the content of the lesson is linked to the existing knowledge and experience of the students, using teaching aids to help explain a concept or skill. In addition, the teacher's teaching must be in line with the student's ability level, ensure that the student is motivated to learn, and constantly monitor the student's performance. This means that quality of instruction practices are related to the pedagogical skills possessed by a teacher (Ambotang & Anuar, 2023; Batjo & Ambotang, 2019). Therefore, quality of instruction requires teachers who are highly skilled in pedagogical knowledge so that teaching can be delivered more effectively. This is important in ensuring that learning outcomes in teaching reading skills can be achieved.

In Malaysia, the latest study on teacher practice in terms of quality of instruction in the teaching of basic reading skills has focused less on various skills in the literacy component. However, past studies have shown that among the teaching methods and techniques used by teachers in teaching basic reading skills are edutainment method such as studies by Norli & Shaid (2023), Unjong & Seruji (2022), and Ahmad et al. (2021), involving remedial students and Literacy and Numeracy Screening Programme (LINUS) students and students who have not reached the minimum level of mastery. The approach of edutainment or learning while playing in the teaching and learning process can provide a fun learning environment for students through the application of humor elements, aesthetics, music, games, acting, singing and storytelling (Aksakal, 2015; Mohamad Rizwan & Roslinda, 2023; Feiyue, 2022; KPM, 2016;). The edutainment method is able to improve learning outcomes by increasing students' motivation to continue learning (Bali, 2023; Feiyue, 2022). In addition, in order to implement quality of instruction, other methods used by teachers are Visual, Auditory, Kinesthetic-Tactile (VAKT) Methods (Ishak & Wan Mohammad, 2020) and Language Learning Strategy (SPB) (Harun et al., 2021; Roslan & Nurahimah, 2017). The findings of the study showed that remedial teachers practiced SPB based on reading skills either through (i) alphabetic approaches, methods, and techniques, (ii) pronunciation of syllables and and reading of meaningful words, (iii) rehearsals, (iv) language ciphers, (v) focused reading, (vi) VAKT methods and (vii) recording and broadcasting.

The practice of teachers using teaching aids in teaching basic reading skills has been the focus of previous studies covering various learning media either in digital or non-digital form. Among the technologies that teachers integrate in teaching and learning include multimedia technology such as mobile applications (Hamzah & Ahmad, 2022); videos (Razali & Zaid, 2022); augmented reality or AR (Ayub, 2022); CD-ROM (Ayob, 2018). Non-digital

materials such as modules, learning kits and reading materials are widely used by teachers in teaching reading skills (Repaso & Macalisang, 2024; Joan, 2024; Crawford et al., 2023; Yusuf et al., 2023; Mazida Tan Ahmad et al., 2023; Nurul Haniza et al., 2018). The level of interactive multimedia use among remedial teachers is high (Mihat, 2022) despite many studies showing that teachers face challenges in preparing teaching aids, especially digital learning materials (Yusri et al., 2024; Avidov-Ungar & Hayak, 2023; Ili Raihana & Suziyani 2023; Norazizah & Khairul Farhah, 2022).

Globally, the quality of instruction in teaching reading skills is emphasized on teachers' competence in delivering teaching using teaching materials in the form of texts, pictures, and images to improve students' skills in integrating texts and pictures (Ohle-Peters, 2023). This is important because teaching aids is usually like a textbook consisting of texts and instructions as well as pictorial materials which means that students as readers need to be skilled in extracting and integrating information based on two sources. Next, a study by Zakeri (2023), in the Hormozgan province of Iran was conducted to identify the components of effective teaching methods needed in the preparation of textbooks for primary school students. Effective textbooks are also needed in teaching to empower primary school teachers. The study took into account the views of experts, supervisors, educators and teachers involving 26 study participants. The study found that in terms of teaching methods, the selection of methods should use concrete materials and be delivered visually using various methods such as demonstration, description, collaborative and even musical methods. The delivery of textbook content should use teaching aid such as images, video clips, films, animations and software programs and be delivered clearly and explicitly to avoid confusion to students.

Methodology

This qualitative study uses a literature review method by analyzing documents based on past studies published from 2018 to 2024. Researchers conduct narrative surveys, which are a type of literature review that summarizes the findings of previous studies on a particular topic (Xiao & Watson, 2019). Article searches are carried out using Scopus, WoS and Google Scholar databases using the right combination of keywords. This is important because the search terms or keywords used are the main elements of the article search process that will affect the effectiveness of the search ((Joklitschke et al., 2018). The article search uses keywords related to basic reading skills, reading skills, literacy skills, Remedial Education, Special Education and Malay Language combined with Boolean searches (AND, OR) and relevant synonymous words. There are two themes analyzed, namely i) the strategies used including approaches, methods and teaching techniques; ii) the use of teaching aids. As a result, a total of 31 related documents have been identified as shown in table 1.

Table 1

Matrix of Literature Review

It	Author	Source	Aims of Study
1.	Abidin et al. (2020)	In 2020 5th IEEE International Conference on Recent Advances and Innovations in Engineering (ICRAIE) (pp. 1-6). IEEE.	Develop and evaluate a brain-based game called 'Mari Membaca' with various interactive multimedia elements to enhance the impact of information delivery to slow learner students.
2.	Affendi & Abd Majid (2022)	<i>Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan</i> , 4(3), 82-94	<i>Evaluate the effectiveness of the application of the game 'JeWo' in improving the reading skills of KV + KV open syllables for students with special needs.</i>
3.	Ahmad & Khoo (2020)	International Journal of Psychological Rehabilitation, 24(07), 7432-7438.	Develop an interactive kit media to help low achievers in reading activities.
4.	Ahmad et al. (2021)	Asian Journal of Civilizational Studies (AJOCs), 3(1), 45-57	Investigate the reading problem among students who have not mastered the minimum level of achievement (BMTPM) of the Malay Language and the influence of entertaining education to increase the readiness of students to learn to read.
5.	Ahmad et al. (2024)	International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development, 13(1), 2756–2763.	Analyse the needs of remedial teachers for the reading skills teaching module for remedial students.
6.	Andrew & Shaid (2024)	International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development, 13(3), 538–549.	Identify the effectiveness of 'Program Intervention 2M' (reading and writing) in helping to improve the minimum mastery level of primary school pupils.
7.	Ayub (2022)	Master's Thesis, Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia.	Develop and evaluate the effectiveness of the Augmented Reality (AR)-based Remedial Module Augmented Reality (ReModAR) learning application equipped with named cloud storage to help remedial students master some basic Malay reading skills.
8.	Ayub et al. (2020)	In 2020 IEEE Student Conference on Research and Development (SCoReD) (pp. 433-437). IEEE.	Develop an AR application education platform application for learning to spell, read and pronounce vowel consonant KVK and evaluate using quiz.
9.	Azid et al. (2020)	International Journal of Instruction, 13(4), 409-426.	Develop an interactive pedagogical tool, Cerdik BM Series 1 to assist students' difficulties in Malay Language literacy skills as one of the ways to support the Literacy and Numeracy Screening (LINUS) programme.

10.	Bidin & Che Ahmad (2022)	Journal of Contemporary Social Science and Education Studies (JOCSES) E-ISSN-2785-8774, 2(1), 100–110	Examine the extent to which remedial teachers in primary schools use the Entertainment Education approach in the teaching and learning process in remedial classes in primary schools.
11.	Busri & Wan Mohammad (2021)	Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan, 3(1), 618-627	Examine the strategies used by Malay language teachers in rural schools in dealing with reading problems among dyslexic students using the Devis Dyslexia Remediation Theory.
12.	Derbala & Yasin (2022)	Malaysian Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities (MJSSH), 7(4), e001445-e001445	Identify the level of knowledge, acceptance, readiness and teaching practices of remedial teachers towards the implementation of differentiated pedagogy in remedial classes.
13.	Gutasan et al. (2021)	Journal of Modern Education, 3(8), 149-166.	Determine the perception of students with learning disabilities towards the use of the LEKSSA Kit as a learning aid that can promote active learning and improve reading proficiency.
14.	Hamzah & Ahmad (2022)	International Journal of Education and Training (InjET), 8(2): 1-8.	Develop an android software-based learning application, 'MyScore Pemulihan' to improve reading skills in Malay subjects among remedial students using the ADDIE Model.
15.	Harun et al. (2021)	Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development, 10(3), 112-129	Observing Language Learning Strategy (SPB) implementation in Bahasa Melayu teaching and learning in mastering reading skill in remedial class.
16.	Hisham (2022)	Amalan Terbaik Dalam Pendidikan Khas dan Inklusif, 1(1).	Improving KV syllable reading skills among students with learning disabilities through the 'Teknik BAYI'.
17.	Ishak & Wan Mohammad (2020)	Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan, 2(2), 24-31	Examine the effectiveness of the VAKT Method in improving the mastery of word reading skills involving digraphs and combined consonants among Year 2 remedial students.
18.	Kasi et al. (2020)	International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development, 9(2), 250–258.	Develop and evaluate the impact of Literacy module on literacy problem among remedial students towards students' achievement in communication skill, reading skill, writing skill.
19.	Long Roslee et al. (2021)	Asian Pendidikan, 1(2), 1-10.	Develop a specific module to improve the reading skills of Orang Asli students and evaluate the effectiveness of the module on them based on the ADDIE model.
20.	Masnan et al. (2021)	EDUINNOVATION 2020, 37.	Develop a teaching and learning aid called 'Didik Hibur 3M' (Reading, writing & numeracy).
21.	Mihat (2022)	Akademika, 92(1), 45-57	To survey the level of multimedia use for learning and facilitating reading skills among remedial teachers.
22.	Mohd Yasin &	Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan, 3(1), 655-665	Determine the level of implementation of the six elements of 21st Century education among

	Anak Atin (2021)		remedial teachers based on their experience in teaching remedial classes.
23.	Norli & Shaid (2023)	Journal for ReAttach Therapy and Developmental Diversities, 6(9s (2)), 825-832.	To study the effectiveness of invention that uses 'Ting-Ting Game' games in remedial students' learning.
24.	Ramli & Hashim (2024)	Semarak International Journal of Innovation in Learning and Education 2, Issue 1 (2024), 1-24.	Develop an interactive AR textbook to learn the vowels a, e, è, i, o, and u for Orang Asli students.
25.	Razali & Ayob (2018)	International Journal of Education, Psychology and Counseling, 3(19), 34-56.	To improve reading skills among students in years 2 and 3 Remedial Education Programme for Bahasa Malaysia subjects by using interactive modules in the form of comics.
26.	Samsudin et al. (2018)	Sains Insani, 3(1), 1-9	Application of the initial model of the Basic Reading Kit in the learning of Malay language of remedial students in letter recognition skills and graphic knowledge.
27.	Shiau Ching & Tahar (2021)	Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan, 3(1), 530-536.	Examine teachers' perception of the use of audiobooks which is one of the multisensory tools in increasing students' interest in learning problems in reading.
28.	Unjong & Seruji (2022)	Asian People Journal (APJ), 5(1), 22-30	Identify the use of entertaining education methods involving four elements, namely singing, storytelling, acting and the use of 2 kerat poems in teaching and learning for LINUS Year 3 students.
29.	Yunus & Ahmad (2019)	International Journal of Academic Research in Business & Social Sciences, 9(11), 1187-1200	To design META ProBaca module based on metacognitive theory, an interactive reading model to enhance reading comprehension skills and reading fluency among dyslexic pupils.
30.	Yusuf et al. (2023)	Jurnal Pendidikan Bitara UPSI, 16, 105-122	To build the 'Jom Bantu Anak Murid' (JOBA) as a teaching aid to improve the Malay reading proficiency of remedial students.
31.	Zairin & Nordin (2023)	Special Education [SE], 1(1), e0008	To increase active participation and improve the reading skills of open syllables, consonants, and vowels (CV) in Malay language by applying a multisensory approach in teaching of special education needs students (SENS).

Findings

The analysis of this literature review study focuses on teaching practices in basic reading skills involving primary school students who achieve low in Malay language subjects. The findings were analysed based on two selected themes, namely the teaching strategies used by teachers and the use of teaching aids.

Teaching Strategies

Teaching strategies include approaches, methods and techniques used by teachers in an effort to improve the level of mastery of basic reading skills among students with low achievement in Malay language subjects such as remedial students, LINUS students, Special Education Needs Students (SENS) and Orang Asli students. Based on the 31 documents analysed, 22 of them ($f=22$; 71%) discussed the approaches, methods and techniques used by teachers. Among them are game-based learning, edutainment, multisensory, differentiated pedagogy, 21st century learning, teacher-centred strategies, Language Learning Strategies (SPB) and intervention programmes as shown in table 2.

Table 2

Teacher Practice in Teaching Basic Reading Skills

Author	Teaching Practice	Targeted Learners
Abidin et al. (2020)	Game-based learning using serious game, "Mari Membaca"	Slow learners
Affendi & Abd Majid (2022)	Game-based learning using 'JeWo' Game	<i>SENS</i>
Ahmad & Khoo (2020)	Game-based learning using interactive kit media	Low achievers
Ahmad et al. (2021)	Edutainment	Low achievers
Ahmad et al. (2024)	Reading teaching module	Remedial students
Andrew & Shaid (2024)	'Program Intervensi 2M' (reading and writing)	Low achievers
Ayub (2022)	Augmented Reality (AR)-based mobile learning application (ReModAR)	Remedial students
Ayub et al. (2020)	Game-based learning using 3D AR application	Remedial students
Azid et al. (2020)	Game-based learning using application 'Cerdik BM Series 1'	LINUS students
Bidin & Che Ahmad (2022)	Edutainment	Remedial students
Busri & Wan Mohammad (2021)	Teacher-centered strategies through symbol mastery, orientation counseling and reading exercises	Dyslexic Students (<i>SENS</i>)
Derbala & Yasin (2022)	Differentiated pedagogy	Remedial students
Gutasan et al. (2021)	Game-based learning using LEKSSA Kit	<i>SENS</i>
Hamzah & Ahmad (2022)	Android-based application 'MyScore Pemulihan'	Remedial students
Harun et al. (2021)	Language Learning Strategy (SPB)	Remedial students
Hisham (2022)	'Teknik BAYI', reading while singing with different melodies	<i>SENS</i>
Ishak & Wan Mohammad (2020)	VAKT Method	Remedial students

Kasi et al. (2020)	Literacy module	Remedial students
Long Roslee et al. (2021)	Reading module, 'Mudah Membaca' (MOA)	Orang Asli students
Masnan et al. (2021)	Game-based learning using and Edutainment using module, 'Didik Hibur 3M'	Remedial students
Mihat (2022)	Multimedia	Remedial students
Mohd Yasin & Anak Atin (2021)	Six elements of 21st Century Education	Remedial students
Norli & Shaid (2023)	Game-based learning using 'Ting-Ting Game'	Remedial students
Ramli & Hashim (2024)	AR textbook	Orang Asli students
Razali & Ayob (2018)	Edutainment using interactive modules in the form of comics	Remedial students
Samsudin et al. (2018)	Basic Reading Kit	Remedial students
Shiau Ching & Tahar (2021)	Audiobooks	<i>SENS</i>
Unjong & Seruji (2022)	Edutainment involving singing, storytelling, acting and poems	LINUS students
Yunus & Ahmad (2019)	META ProBaca, an interactive reading module	Dyslexic Students
Yusuf et al. (2023)	Game-based learning using Kit 'Jom Bantu Anak Murid' (JOBA)	Remedial students
Zairin & Nordin (2023)	Game-based learning using multisensory Ball Game	<i>SENS</i>

Game-based learning using the concept of learning while playing was extensively studied involving 10 of the 31 previous studies identified. There are four games that utilize digital technology, namely the Augmented Reality (AR) application by Ayub et al (2020), the serious game by Abidin et al (2020), the mobile learning application by Azid et al (2020), the interactive media kit consisting of interactive games and AR cards as proposed by Ahmad & Khoo (2020). The integration of AR technology by Ayob et al (2020), allows remedial students to see three-dimensional (3D) objects when the AR card is scanned using a camera. After the AR cards are scanned, the assessment of students' learning is carried out through a selection of quizzes available on the AR application built with a game concept. The use of AR helps remedial students learn KVK syllable words more interestingly and effectively when learning through personal experience can be achieved using immersive technology. However, there are also traditional games such as the 'Ting-Ting Game' (Norli & Shaid, 2023), game-based learning kits (Yusuf et al., 2023; Gutasan et al., 2021) and the Jewo game (Affendi & Abd Majid, 2022) which gives students many options without the use of technological equipment that involves high costs.

In addition, the concept of learning while playing is also applied in teaching basic reading skills through an entertaining education approach or edutainment method. There are five studies

discussing teaching methods based on edutainment method, namely Ahmad et al (2021); Bidin & Che Ahmad (2022); Hisham (2022); Unjong & Seruji (2022); and Masnan et al (2021). Masnan et al (2021), developed the module "Didik Hibur 3M" as a teaching material for basic reading, writing and numeracy skills for Orang Asli students. This module combines the concept of learning while playing with edutainment elements through play, creativity and singing activities. Meanwhile, Hisham (2022), introduced a teaching method called 'Teknik BAYI', which is a method of reading while singing using various melodies. The word 'BAYI' is made up of syllables in the words 'Baca' and 'NyanYI' and this method is a best practice in teaching syllable reading for SENS. Ahmad et al (2021), examined the influence of edutainment method to increase the readiness to learn Malay reading skills among students who have not reached the Minimum Proficiency Level (BMTPM). The edutainment method is a teaching method that is relaxed, fun and can increase students' motivation. BMTPM students were found to be less motivated and not interested in learning something that they found difficult. Therefore, Ahmad et al (2021), suggested that teachers use the edutainment method in teaching reading to increase students' motivation and willingness to learn. Although the level of implementation of the edutainment method is high among remedial teachers (Bidin & Che Ahmad, 2022), Unjong & Seruji (2022), found that acting, storytelling and two-clip rhymes are less practiced in teaching reading involving LINUS students. This means that, in the method of edutainment, teachers tend to use singing techniques rather than acting or storytelling techniques.

Next, the concept of learning while playing and multisensory methods are integrated in teaching sessions to improve the level of mastery of SENS in basic reading skills (Zairin & Nordin, 2023). Zairin & Nordin (2023), implemented a multisensory method into eight sessions of teaching open syllable reading skills through ball games. The ball games requires SENS bouncing and catching the ball while spelling and pronouncing syllables which is involve movement and touching that can increase the stimulation of the visual, auditory and tactile senses. Meanwhile, Ishak & Wan Mohammad (2020), used Visual, Auditory, Kinesthetic and Tactile (VAKT) methods on remedial students for digraph and combined consonant skills. Although the level of implementation of the six elements of 21st Century Education (PAK21) among remedial teachers is moderate (Mohd Yasin & Anak Utin, 2021), teachers shows a high level of knowledge, acceptance, readiness and differentiated teaching practices (Derbala & Yasin, 2022).

Despite the various challenges and constraints faced, teachers strive to diversify teaching methods based on students' differences in cognitive, multi-intelligence, and learning styles through various Language Learning Strategies (SPB) such as focused reading, drilling and practices, singing, reading in pairs with friends and listening to teachers' readings (Harun et al., 2021). Meanwhile, the implementation of the 'Program Intervensi 2M' is carried out outside of teaching and learning sessions involving BMTPM level one students who have not mastered the basic reading skills through more focused individual teaching (Andrew & Shaid, 2024). Busri & Wan Mohammad (2021), adapted Davis' Dyslexia Correction Theory in teaching reading to dyslexic students through three main procedures, namely symbol mastery, orientation counseling and reading practice. Teacher-centered strategies in the three main procedures of Davis Dyslexia Correction Theory can help teachers guide dyslexic students in a more structured and planned manner.

Use of Teaching Aids

The practice of using teaching aids in teaching basic reading skills has been extensively studied with various forms of innovation including technology-based and non-technology-based. Of the 31 articles analysed, 20 articles ($f=20$; 65%) examined the use of teaching aids. A total of 11 studies examined the use of non-digital teaching aids (learning kits; modules; games), while nine studies examined teaching aids based on digital technology (AR; digital games; mobile applications; audiobooks).

Among the non-digital teaching aids include the 'Jom Bantu Anak Murid' (JOBA) learning kit which contains learning materials such as picture cards and game boards such as *padang ilmu*, targeted board, monopoly board, *ketinting* game, giant board, circuit tracks and Robot Society (RS) (Yusuf et al., 2023). The JOBA kit was built to improve the mastery of Malay reading skills of remedial students consisting of constructs one to four in the Malay Language literacy skills of the LINUS Programme. The Reading Basics Kit developed by Samsudin et al. (2018) is an initial model for learning to recognize letters and graphic knowledge for remedial students consisting of letter matching flashcards, module books, models, and story books. Gutasan et al (2021), built a teaching aid that can promote active learning and improve the mastery of SENS reading skills independently called the LEXSSA Kit (*Lebih Efektif X-Seronok Sesuai Aras Murid*). The LEXSSA kit consists of seven items that can be used together in a teaching and learning session inculcating elements of learning while playing through games such as a syllable wheel, smart telescope, word chess and simple sentence songs.

In addition, non-digital teaching aids in the form of modules dominated the findings with six related studies identified involving remedial students (3), Orang Asli students (2) and SENS (1). Five studies focused on module design, development and evaluation and one study by Razali & Ayob (2018), examined the effectiveness of interactive modules on the achievement of remedial students. Ahmad et al. (2024) and Yunus & Ahmad (2019), formulate the criteria needed in developing a module based on the theory and needs of students to produce quality teaching products that meet curriculum standards. To improve the reading skills of Orang Asli students, Long Roslee et al (2021), built a specific module called 'Mudah Membaca' (MOA), while Masnan et al (2021), built an entertaining education-based module called 'Didik Hibur 3M' (Reading, writing, numeracy). The Literacy Module built by Kasi et al (2020), to improve the literacy skills of remedial students is based on the Pyramid Approach and Skinner's Verbal behavior theory.

There are two teaching aids based on non-digital games, namely "Ting-Ting Game" by Kasi et al (2020), and "JeWo" by Affendi & Abd Majid (2022). "Ting-Ting Game" is a traditional game for children also known as hopscotch, which requires a squared area to play because the player has to jump with one leg to move from one square to another. "Ting-Ting Game" is used as an intervention tool to improve the mastery of vowel skills and the learning motivation of remedial students. Meanwhile, the game "JeWo" is a colorful block game used as an intervention tool in improving the KV+KV syllable reading skills for SENS.

Furthermore, the findings of the study found that the use of teaching aid based on digital technology is dominated by the application of immersive technology, namely AR. Based on a study by Ahmad & Khoo (2020), there is a high need for the use of interactive media kits in teaching basic reading skills to low-achievement students. Interactive media kits consisting

of interactive games, AR cards and electronic books have a significant impact on improving students' proficiency levels in reading skills. An AR-based mobile learning application known as Remedial Module Augmented Reality (ReModAR) equipped with cloud storage was developed by Ayub (2022), to overcome the inability of remedial students to read words consonant-vowel-consonant (KVK), digraph, consonant-vowel-consonant-consonant (KVKK) and vowel-consonant-vowel (VKV). ReModAR is a complete module based on a previous study by Ayub et al (2020), in the development of an AR card application that allows students to see objects in three dimensions (3D) using a camera scan. Ramli & Hashim (2024), developed an AR-based interactive textbook for learning vowels for Orang Asli students.

In addition, multimedia technology is utilized by three studies on the development of digital learning applications, namely "MyScore Pemulihan" by Hamzah & Ahmad (2022), for remedial students, Cerdik BM Series 1 by Azid et al (2020), for LINUS students and the serious game "Mari Membaca" by Abidin et al (2020), for low-achievement students. Two mobile learning applications developed using a learning while playing approach are Cerdik BM Series 1 and the game "Mari Membaca" which provides a more enjoyable learning experience to students. Although the use of multimedia among remedial teachers is at a high level (Mihat, 2022), the practice of using teaching aid based on interactive multimedia needs to be cultivated because it has been proven to be able to improve students' cognitive potential and language skills. In addition to incorporating multimedia elements in the construction of teaching aid, the use of multisensory-based audiobooks has received a positive perception among Special Education teachers in increasing their interest in reading SENS.

Discussion

The findings of the study show that, in teaching basic reading skills, teachers diversify teaching methods and techniques and use various teaching aids to improve students' proficiency level. This coincides with the statement of Slavin (1995; 2006) and Sowell (2017) that the quality of teachers' teaching is closely related to the teaching methods and techniques used by teachers. Slavin (1995; 2006) stated that a quality teacher will deliver the content of the lesson in an orderly and systematic manner, explaining clearly by providing relevant examples through the use of teaching aid to help explain a concept in a way that is easy for students to understand. Quality teacher teaching is important to prevent students from mastering reading skills and falling behind in mastering other skills (Savitry & Norasmah, 2022; Nur Syamira & Harun, 2021). They will experience dropouts in learning if they are not assisted through effective methods of teaching basic reading skills (Wan Nurzuliana, 2019). In addition, through effective teaching methods, students' impressions of reading activities will be more positive by believing that reading skills are not difficult to learn (Sham, 2018).

The concept of learning while playing is widely applied by teachers in teaching basic reading skills through a game-based learning method or also known as gamification. Gamification is one of the 21st century learning methods that is creative and innovative and effective in improving students' cognitive ability and knowledge (Ling & Wan Mohammad, 2024) as well as being proven to be able to improve students' academic performance (Sáez-López et al., 2023). In addition, the use of gamification methods in teaching can foster students' enthusiasm, feelings of joy, excitement and not boredom (Abdullah & Razak, 2021). The gamification method not only increases students' enthusiasm and independence, but also allows students to carry out assessments of their own performance through the feedback

provided (Munuyandi et al., 2021). In addition, learning by playing more is more engaging and motivating for students through a fun learning environment (Aliza & Zamri, 2016). In fact, play is the best way to help students master abstract language concepts through concrete experiences and can stimulate students' interest in continuing to learn to read.

In addition, the concept of learning while playing through edutainment methods is more focused by teachers in teaching basic reading skills. The edutainment approach emphasizes a fun learning environment in a well-planned manner. Based on the KSSR Information Book (2017), edutainment is defined as educating while entertaining, relaxed and fun in a controlled state. The element of fun will exist through learning that is relaxing, interesting, entertaining, meaningful and alluring that can help strengthen understanding and encourage students to learn. The use edutainment elements such as humor emphasizes fun through elements of humor that can entice students to continue learning (Mazlan, 2016). This strategy is included in KSSR as one of the elements of school curriculum transformation (KPM, 2011). A reasonable emphasis is placed on entertaining education is interesting and fun delivery techniques such as singing, storytelling, acting and poetry. Edutainment also means the combination of education with entertainment aspects as well as various types of media such as sound, animation, video, text and images. Therefore, edutainment can be interpreted as a teaching method that prioritizes the elements of fun and entertainment in learning, which can stimulate students' interest in understanding and exploring without fear and discomfort. As a result, meaningful and effective learning can be produced that increases student achievement.

In the Malay language teaching strategy, edutainment is carried out according to the context of the content of the subject and uses a variety of teaching and learning strategies and materials that can pose challenges to curiosity, control, fantasy, collaboration, healthy competition and recognition (KPM, 2019). Studies have found that the use of edutainment methods can address the issue of mastery of reading skills more effectively (Agus, 2021). By integrating edutainment elements such as storytelling, singing, acting, and interactive games into the teaching method, teachers can create an engaging learning environment that stimulates students' interest and motivation to learn to read. However, the success of the implementation of edutainment method depends on the knowledge, skills, and willingness of teachers to adapt and use these strategies effectively in the classroom. In addition, study found that Malay language teachers face challenges in implementing quality teaching practices such as edutainment methods due to the less conducive school environment, time constraints and workload, as well as lack of support from administrators and negative perceptions of the practices (Simon & Yasin, 2022). This is so because entertaining education requires teachers' creativity in stimulating and increasing student involvement throughout the teaching and learning period. Teachers' creativity in providing a variety of teaching aids and instruments based on edutainment requires careful planning to optimise student learning outcomes. The study also found that although the level of knowledge and readiness of Malay language teachers for the edutainment method is high, the level of skill of teachers in the implementation of this method is at a moderate level (Muthu et al., 2024). In addition, Malay language teachers face difficulties in implementing edutainment -based assessments, causing them to tend to use conventional methods due to their lack of understanding of techniques using mind stimulation according to various levels of students' abilities (Ahmad & Othman, 2020).

Furthermore, the practice of integrating digital technology in teaching and learning will improve the quality of instruction by changing the way teachers deliver from a conventional approach to a more creative and innovative approach (Ridho et al., 2021). As a result, students' learning will be more active, enjoyable and can increase students' concentration. However, many studies have shown that teachers face challenges in preparing teaching aids, especially digital learning materials (Avidov-Ungar & Hayak, 2023; Ili Raihana & Suziyani 2023; Norazizah & Khairul Farhah, 2022; Yusri et al., 2024). There are still many Malay language teachers who use traditional methods in delivering teaching and lack of integration of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) elements in the classroom due to the low attitude and willingness of teachers towards the practice (Munusamy & Jamaludin, 2022). Nagaretnam & Mahmud (2022), found that the level of teacher acceptance of ICT is at a low level. This is because teachers' acceptance of technology depends on the teacher's attitude and experience towards technology (Scherer et al., 2020). Due to the lack of integration of ICT in the teaching of reading skills, teaching aids in the form of digital materials has not been fully developed optimally. Therefore, Malay language teachers still use teaching aid which is less effective and less innovative which affects teachers' delivery methods (Munusamy & Jamaludin, 2022). In 21st Century Learning, teachers need to make the best use of technology in the teaching and learning process to optimize student success in line with the era of digitalization globalization in education.

The implication is that in ensuring quality of instruction is delivered, teachers' pedagogical skills need to be enhanced through continuous Professional Development Programmes such as appropriate training and courses. Teachers also need to be trained in the use of technology tools in teaching so that they can provide various teaching aids in a more creative and innovative manner (Shuhaiza & Abdul Halim, 2023). In addition to the support of school administrators and sufficient resources, teachers need to improve their teaching practices by practicing 21st Century teaching and learning which is rich in elements of edutainment and differentiated pedagogy. In the practice of 21st Century teaching and learning, the main emphasis is placed on technological skills, computer competence, and digital technology-based teaching strategies (Manugaran et al., 2022). In this regard, teachers must diversify teaching methods and techniques to meet the needs of each student who are different from each other in terms of experience, behaviour, practice, talents, abilities and cognitive abilities (KPM, 2019). Therefore, if the teaching strategies and methods for students can be implemented according to the characteristics of 21st Century teaching and learning, it is expected that they will have a high willingness to learn to read. This practice needs to be widely applied among teachers to increase students' motivation and concentration in learning. By taking these steps, more effective instruction can be achieved, and subsequently improve the quality of education delivery in line with the requirements of PPPM 2013-2025.

Conclusion

This study found that primary school Malay teachers practice various teaching methods and techniques in an effort to improve the level of mastery of basic reading skills of students. Among the main methods used by Malay language teachers are learning while playing and edutainment. In addition, in teaching basic reading skills, teachers also diversify teaching aids, especially non-digital learning materials such as modules. Therefore, to improve the quality of students' learning, the learning method while playing, the edutainment method and the use of modules need to be practiced more widely among Malay language teachers. These

practices need to be given important attention because they are closely related to the quality of teachers' teaching and also the improvement of student achievement. Therefore, it can be concluded that quality teacher teaching practices will make students' learning more effective not only in terms of skills and knowledge, but also in terms of personality that supports students' aspirations in line with the aspirations of PPPM 2013-2025. In addition, quality teacher teaching practices will be able to meet the target of achieving 100% minimum mastery of Malay language literacy skills. In fact, quality teacher teaching practices are able to improve the quality of the teaching profession in line with the requirements of the Malaysian Teacher Standard which will improve the quality of education in the country to reach the top third of international standards.

References

- Abbas, M. J. D. Q., & Husssain, S. (2021). Low literacy rate at primary level: Identification of causes and impacts. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 5(2), 492-506.
- Abd Ghani, A., Muslim, N. H., & Zakaria, M. N. (2020). The effects of gender and academic achievement on reading fluency among Year 2 Malaysian school children. *International Journal of Pediatric Otorhinolaryngology*, 132, 109907.
- Abdullah, F., & Abdul Razak, K. (2021). Tahap minat dan penerimaan pelajar terhadap gamifikasi dalam bidang Sirah: Level of interest and acceptance of students towards gamification in Islamic History. *Journal of Quran Sunnah Education & Special Needs*, 5(1), 27-38.
- Abella, J., Kilag, O. K., Andrin, G., Taniza, F. N., Groenewald, E., & Cordova Jr, N. (2024). Benchmarking Literacy and Numeracy: The contributing elements. Excellencia: *International Multi-disciplinary Journal of Education* (2994-9521), 2(1), 90-99.
- Abidin, S. R. Z., Noor, S. F. M., Sahari, N., & Talib, N. H. A. (2020, December). Serious Game Development-A Miraculous Literacy Tool for Halus Students. In *2020 5th IEEE International Conference on Recent Advances and Innovations in Engineering (ICRAIE)* (pp. 1-6). IEEE.
- Affendi, S., & Abd Majid, R. (2022). Pengaplikasian permainan 'JeWo' dalam meningkatkan kemahiran membaca suku kata terbuka KV + KV Murid Berkeperluan Pendidikan Khas. *Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan*, 4(3), 82-94.
- Agus, A. N. A. (2021). Tahap pengetahuan dan kesediaan guru Bahasa Melayu dalam melaksanakan pendekatan terbeza dalam pengajaran dan pembelajaran di rumah semasa tempoh perintah kawalan pergerakan (The level of knowledge and readiness Malay Language teachers' to implementation different approach in home teaching and learning during movement control order). *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Melayu*, 11(1), 75-87.
- Ahmad, M. T., Razalli, A. R., & Shafei, K. (2024). Teaching module requirements analysis review reading skills among special recovery teachers. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 13(1), 2756–2763.
- Ahmad, N. A., & Khoo, Y. Y. (2020). Need analysis on improving reading skills using interactive kit media among low achievers. *International Journal of Psychological Rehabilitation*, 24(07), 7432-7438.
- Ahmad, N., & Othman, S. (2020). Penggunaan kaedah didik hibur dalam pengajaran kemahiran membaca guru Bahasa Melayu sekolah rendah. *International Journal of Education and Training*, 6(2), 1-11.

- Ahmad, N., Othman, S., Sabil, A. M., Mokhtar, M. M., Nawawi, M. A. M., & Hason, Z. (2021). Pengaruh didik hibur dalam meningkatkan kesediaan belajar kemahiran membaca Bahasa Melayu murid belum menguasai tahap pencapaian minimum [The influence of edutainment in enhancing the learning readiness of reading skills in Malay Language of low achieve. *Asian Journal of Civilizational Studies (AJOCS)*, 3(1), 45-57.
- Aksakal, N. (2015). *Theoretical view to the approach of edutainment. Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 186, 1232-1239.
- Ali, A., & Mahamod Z., (2016). Pembangunan dan kebolegunaan Modul Berasaskan Bermain bagi pembelajaran kemahiran Bahasa Melayu kanak-kanak prasekolah. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Melayu – JPBM*, Vol. 6, Bil. 1, 16-29.
- Ambotang, A. S., & Anuar, L. (2023). *Pengaruh pengetahuan pedagogi, pengetahuan kandungan dan komitmen guru terhadap kualiti pengajaran. Jurnal Pemikir Pendidikan*, 11(1), 50-60.
- Andrew, M. A., & Shaid, N. A. N. (2024). The effectiveness of “Program Intervensi 2M” in helping to improve the minimum mastery level of primary school pupils. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development* 13(3), 538–549.
- Arenius, P., & Lenz, A. K. (2024). *Beyond the paradigm of literacy—developing a research agenda in entrepreneurship. Journal of Business Venturing Insights*, 21, e00442.
- Avidov-Ungar, O., & Hayak, M. (2023). Education and games: Teachers’ professional knowledge in integrating digital games into instruction in school. In *Game Theory-From Idea to Practice*. IntechOpen.
- Ayob, A. (2018). Impak penggunaan CD-ROM Kaedah Cepat Membaca dan Menulis huruf kosonan. *Journal of Information System and Technology Management*, 3(7), 126-139.
- Ayub, A. A. (2022). *Augmented reality application to improve remedial student’s learning performance*. Master’s Thesis, Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia.
- Ayub, A. A., Othman, M. B., Sahar, N. M., Azni, M. S. M. N., Ilyas, M. A., & Jaafar, M. B. (2020, September). Learning tools of KVK module using augmented reality mobile application for remedial education program (REP). In *2020 IEEE Student Conference on Research and Development (SCoReD)* (pp. 433-437). IEEE.
- Azid, N., Yusoff, N., Rawian, R., Sabarudin, N., & Ishak, M. Z. (2020). Evaluating User Experience of Using Cerdik BM Series 1 Interactive Pedagogical Tool. *International Journal of Instruction*, 13(4), 409-426.
- Bali, M. M. E. I. (2023). Application of the edutainment method to improve student learning outcomes. In *proceedings of International Conference on Education, Society and Humanity*, Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 1344-1351.
- Batjo, N., & Ambotang, A. S. (2019). *Pengaruh pengajaran guru terhadap kualiti pengajaran guru. Malaysian Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities (MJSSH)*, 4(2), 30 - 42.
- Bidin, M., & Che Ahmad, A. (2022). Implementing the teaching and learning processes of didik hibur edutainment approach among remedial education teachers in penang. *Journal of Contemporary Social Science and Education Studies (JOCSSSES) E-ISSN- 2785-8774*, 2(1), 100–110.
- Busri, A., & Wan Mohammad, W. (2021). Strategi pengajaran guru Bahasa Melayu dalam menangani masalah bacaan dalam kalangan murid disleksia di sekolah rendah pedalaman Sarawak. *Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan*, 3(1), 618-627.
- Carroll, J. (1963). *A model of school learning. Teachers College Record*, 64, 723-733.

- Cheng, L., & Mohamad Nasri, N. (2022). Cabaran guru sekolah rendah pedalaman terhadap penggunaan standard 4 (PdPC) SKPMg2 dalam menilai PdPR. *Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan*, 3(4), 364-373.
- Ching, L. W. S. & Nasri, N. M. (2021). Hubungan antara tahap kebolehan pengajaran dengan pengalaman mengajar guru Bahasa Melayu dalam mengaplikasikan pedagogi responsif budaya. *Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan*, 3(2), 468-483.
- Crawford, M., Rutkowski, D., & Rutkowski, L. (2023). *Improving reading abilities, attitudes and practices: A home-based intervention of supplementary texts for young readers in Cambodia. International Journal of Educational Development*, 103, 102906.
- Derbala, R., & Yasin, R. M. (2022). Tahap pengetahuan, penerimaan, kesediaan dan amalan pengajaran guru pemulihan khas terhadap pengajaran terbeza. *Malaysian Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities (MJSSH)*, 7(4), e001445-e001445.
- Dewan Negara Malaysia. (2023). *Pemberitahuan Pertanyaan Lisan Dewan Negara Mesyuarat Pertama 2023, Penggal Kedua, Parlimen Kelima Belas. No Soalan 25.*
- Feiyue, Z. (2022). *Edutainment methods in the learning process: Quickly, fun and satisfying. International Journal of Environment, Engineering and Education*, 4(1), 19-26.
- Grotluschen, A., Buddeberg, K., Dutz, G., Heilmann, L., & Stammer, C. (2020). Low literacy in Germany. Results from the second German literacy survey. *European journal for Research on the Education and Learning of Adults*, 11(1), 127-143.
- Gutasan, N., Karim, R. S., Kudin, Z. M., & Hassan, N. J. (2021). Kit LEXSSA meningkatkan kemahiran bacaan murid bermasalah pembelajaran. *Journal of Modern Education*, 3(8), 149-166.
- Hamzah, R. R., & Ahmad, A. C. (2022). Reka bentuk dan pembangunan MyScore Pemulihan dalam meningkatkan kemahiran membaca Bahasa Melayu murid Pemulihan Khas. *International Journal of Education and Training (InJET)*, 8(2): 1-8.
- Harun, N. A., Lambri, A., & Reduzan, N. H. (2021). Language Learning Strategy (SPB) Used by remedial teachers for remedial students mastery of reading skill in Bahasa Melayu class. *Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 10(3), 112-129.
- Hisham, N. H. B. B. (2022). Meningkatkan kemahiran membaca suku kata KV dalam kalangan murid bermasalah pembelajaran melalui teknik BAYI. *Amalan Terbaik Dalam Pendidikan Khas dan Inklusif*, 1(1).
- Huitt, W. (2000). *Slavin's QAIT model*. Educational Psychology Interactive. Valdosta, GA: Valdosta State University.
- Rashid, I. R., & Mohamed, S., (2023). Cabaran guru melaksanakan pendekatan bermain dalam PdP di prasekolah. *Malaysian Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities (MJSSH)* 8(6): e002204. 1-16.
- Ishak, N., & Wan Mohammad, W. (2020). Keberkesanan VAKT Dalam Meningkatkan Penguasaan Membaca Perkataan Digraf Dan Konsonan Bergabung Bahasa Melayu Murid Melanau Di Kelas Pemulihan Khas. *Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan*, 2(2), 24-31.
- Ismail, M. R., Ghazali, A. R., & Latif, K. A. A. (2024). [MS] Faktor-Faktor Keberkesanan Pengajaran Bahasa Arab: Satu Sorotan Literatur Berdasarkan Kajian-Kajian Lepas: Factors of Effectiveness in the Teaching of Arabic Language: A Literature Review Based on Past Studies. *Afaq Lughawiyah*, 2(1), 306-322.
- Joan, F. (2024). Enhancing Reading Literacy in Grade 2 Pupils: An Evaluation of the Enhanced Marungko Approach. *Ho Chi Minh City Open University Journal of Science-Social Sciences*, 14(4).

- Joklitschke, J., Rott, B. & Schindler, M. (2018). Theories about mathematical creativity in contemporary research: a literature review. *Proceedings of the 42nd Conference of the International Group for the Psychology of Mathematics Education*, 3 (pp. 171–178).
- Kasi, V., Ahmad, N. A., & Sundram, A. (2020). Improving Literacy Skill among Remedial Children using Literacy Module. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 9(2), 250–258.
- Kementerian Pelajaran Malaysia. (2011). *Standard Kurikulum Seni Bahasa dalam Kurikulum Standard Sekolah Rendah*. Bahagian Perkembangan Kurikulum, Putrajaya. Malaysia.
- Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia. (2013). *Pelan Pembangunan Pendidikan Malaysia 2013-2025*. Putrajaya: Bahagian Perancangan dan Penyelidikan Dasar Pendidikan.
- Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia. (2016). *Buku Penerangan KSSR Semakan 2017*. Bahagian Pembangunan Kurikulum, Putrajaya. Malaysia.
- Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia. (2019). *Pelaporan Pentaksiran Sekolah Rendah 2019*. Putrajaya. Malaysia.
- Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia. (2023a). *Kamus Kompetensi Pegawai Perkhidmatan Pendidikan Laluan Pengajaran dan Pembelajaran (PdP)*. Putrajaya: Bahagian Profesionalisme Guru.
- Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia. (2023b). *Laporan Tahunan 2022 Pelan Pembangunan Pendidikan Malaysia 2013-2025*. Putrajaya: Bahagian Perancangan dan Penyelidikan Dasar Pendidikan.
- Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia. (2023c). *Standard Guru Malaysia 2.0 (SGM2.0)*. Putrajaya: Bahagian Profesionalisme Guru.
- Lee Ling, L., & Wan Mohammad, W. (2024). Amalan gamifikasi melalui pengajaran penulisan karangan Bahasa Melayu dalam kalangan guru di Sekolah Jenis Kebangsaan Cina. *Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan*, 6(1), 1-13.
- Long Roslee, L., Abdul Wahab, N., & Nordin, N. A. (2021). Membina Modul Mudah Membaca MOA bagi meningkatkan kemahiran membaca murid Orang Asli. *Asian Pendidikan*, 1(2), 1-10.
- Arshad, M., (2022). *Pendidikan Literasi Awal Kanak-Kanak: Teori dan Amali*. Penerbit Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris.
- Manugaran, S., Atan, N. A., & Yusof, S. M. (2022). Pengintegrasian permainan berkomputer dalam pembelajaran kesusasteraan Bahasa Tamil bagi penguasaan kemahiran abad ke-21 murid sekolah. *Innovative Teaching and Learning Journal*, 6(1), 85-106.
- Masnan, A. H., Peh, S. S., & Alias, A. (2021). Didik-hibur 3M (membaca, menulis dan mengira) murid Orang Asli di sekolah rendah sekolah. *EDUINNOVATION 2020*, 37.
- Isa, M., N. S., & Mahamod, Z. (2021). Tahap pengetahuan, sikap dan masalah guru Bahasa Melayu terhadap penerapan kemahiran berfikir aras tinggi dalam pengajaran dan pembelajaran komsas [Levels of knowledge, attitudes and problems of Malay Language teachers towards the application of higher level thinking skills in teaching and learning komsas]. *Asian People Journal (APJ)*, 4 (1), 93–107.
- Ahmad, M., Razalli, A. R. & Shaffeei, K. (2023). Tinjauan analisis keperluan modul pengajaran kemahiran membaca dalam kalangan Guru Pemulihan Khas. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bitara UPSI*, 16, 92-104.
- Ismail, M. (2016). *Pengajaran Bahasa Melayu, Didik Hibur dan Seni Bahasa*, Dewan Bahasa Dan Pustaka, Kuala Lumpur.
- Mihat, M. D. (2022). Tahap penggunaan multimedia bagi PDPC kemahiran membaca dalam kalangan Guru Pemulihan Khas. *Akademika*, 92(1), 45-57.

- Mohd Nor, M. R., & Rosli, R. (2023). Elemen didik hiburan dalam buku teks Matematik Kurikulum Standard Sekolah Rendah. *Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan*, 5(1), 346-359.
- Subri, R., Yaakub, R., & Nudin, A. B. (2021). Pelaksanaan pengajaran guru cemerlang dalam mata pelajaran Bahasa Melayu ketika pandemik COVID-19: Satu kajian kes. *PENDETA: Journal of Malay Language, Education and Literature*, 12, 21-32.
- Mohd Yasin, M., & Anak Atin, S. (2021). Tahap pelaksanaan pendidikan abad ke-21 dalam kalangan Guru Pemulihan Khas Negeri Sarawak. *Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan*, 3(1), 655-665.
- Munusamy, K., & Jamaludin, K. A. (2022). Cabaran guru untuk mengintegrasikan teknologi maklumat dan komunikasi (TMK) bagi meningkatkan kemahiran membaca dalam kalangan murid. *Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan*, 4(3), 265-273.
- Munuyandi, T. A., Husain, S., Jabar, M. A. A., & Jusoh, Z. (2021). Effectiveness of quizizz in interactive teaching and learning Malay grammar. *Asian Journal of University Education*, 17(3), 109–118.
- Muthu, A. P., Rahman, S. B., & Surat, S. (2024). Knowledge, skills, and readiness of teachers in using entertainment teaching methods to address Malay Language reading issues among vernacular school (SJK) students. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 13(1), 2270–2276.
- Nagaretnam, M., & Mahmud, M. S. (2022). Kesediaan guru dan keberkesanan pelaksanaan pengajaran Matematik abad ke-21 di sekolah rendah: Sebuah Tinjauan Literatur. *Malaysian Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities (MJSSH)*, 7(11), e001876-e001876.
- Norok, N. M., & Khairuddin, K. F. (2022). Tahap kesediaan guru terhadap penggunaan kaedah bermain sambil belajar bagi Murid Berkeperluan Khas Pembelajaran. *Malaysian Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities (MJSSH)* 7(1): 132-144.
- Nordheim, O., & Huijts, T. (2023). Social functioning and personal development among individuals with low literacy skills; the role of active labour market policy. *Journal of Social Policy*, 1-27.
- Norli, M. A., & Shaid, N. A. N. (2023). The ‘Ting-ting Game’ as psychology intervention to mitigate vowel reading skill among remedial pupils. *Journal for ReAttach Therapy and Developmental Diversities*, 6(9s (2)), 825-832.
- Nor, N. S. M., & Baharudin, H., (2021). Masalah murid disleksia dan gaya pengajaran guru dalam pembelajaran Bahasa Arab [Problems of dyslexia students and teachings style for learning of arabic language]. *International Journal of Advanced Research in Islamic Studies and Education*, 1(2), 26-44.
- Samsudin, N. H., Wahid, P. R. A., & Ja’afar, S. (2018). Pengaplikasian model awal Kit Asas Membaca dalam pembelajaran Bahasa Melayu kanak-kanak Pemulihan Khas. *Jurnal Sains Insani*, 3(1), 1-9.
- Ohle-Peters, A., McElvany, N., & Ullrich, M. 2023. Students’ text-picture-integration: The role of teacher competence and instructional quality. *International Journal of Educational Psychology: IJEP*, 12(3), 251-268.
- Pitoyo, A. (2020). A meta-analysis: Factors affecting students’ reading interest in Indonesia. *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 7(7), 83-92.
- Ramli, N., & Hashim, M. E. A. H. (2024). Interactive AR textbook application for 3M Orang Asli students in primary school. *Semarak International Journal of Innovation in Learning and Education* 2, Issue 1 (2024), 1-24.

- Razali, N. A., & Zaid, N. M. (2022). The effectiveness of the constructivism video approach in self-learning Malay sentence building skills for special rehabilitation students:/Keberkesanan pembelajaran sendiri bagi kemahiran membina ayat dalam Bahasa Melayu menggunakan video pendekatan konstruktivisma terhadap murid Pemulihan Khas. *Sains Humanika*, 14(3-2), 45-53.
- Razali, R. M., & Ayob, A. (2018). Keberkesanan penggunaan modul interaktif terhadap pencapaian membaca murid Pemulihan. *International Journal of Education, Psychology and Counseling*, 3(19), 34-56.
- Repaso, J. C., & Macalisang, D. S. (2024). Effectiveness of contextualized Marungko Approach-Based supplementary reading material. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary: Applied Business and Education Research*, 5(3), 1117-1126.
- Ridho, S., Wardani, S., & Saptono, S. (2021). Development of local wisdom digital books to improve critical thinking skills through problem-based learning. *Journal of Innovative Science Education*, 10(1), 1-7.
- Roser, M. (2024). *Millions of children learn only very little. How can the world provide a better education to the next generation*. Our World in Data.
- Chin, R., & Yusof, N. (2017). Penggunaan Strategi Pembelajaran Bahasa untuk menguasai kemahiran membaca dalam kalangan murid Pemulihan Khas. *Proceedings of ICSOTL 2017*, 1-13.
- Saez-Lopez, J. M., Grimaldo-Santamaría, R. Ó., Quicios-García, M. a. P., & Vázquez-Cano, E. (2023). Teaching the use of gamification in elementary school: a case in Spanish formal education. *Technology, Knowledge and Learning*, 29(1), 557–581.
- Said, A. R. M., Omar, M. C., Omar, N., & Ghazali, M. A. (2023). Meningkatkan pembangunan profesional dan kompetensi Guru Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia: satu analisis kritis. *Global Journal of Educational Research and Management*, 3(1), 63-71.
- Samsudin, N. H., Abdul Wahid, P. R., & Ja'afar, S. (2018). Pengaplikasian Model Awal Kit Asas Membaca dalam pembelajaran Bahasa Melayu kanak-kanak Pemulihan Khas. *Sains Insani*, 3(1), 1-9.
- Chelliah, S., & Othman, N. (2022). Tahap penguasaan Bahasa Melayu dengan pencapaian prestasi mata pelajaran Perniagaan murid bukan Melayu. *Malaysian Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities (MJSSH)* 7(5): 1-16.
- Ching, S. L., & Tahar, M. (2021). Penggunaan peralatan multisensori buku audio dalam meningkatkan minat murid-murid masalah pembelajaran terhadap membaca. *Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan*, 3(1), 530-536.
- Sharif, S. M., & Masnan, A. H. (2023). Implementation of best practices in Malay teaching (ATP) based on the Zemelman Model among preschool teachers: Pelaksanaan amalan terbaik Pengajaran (ATP) Bahasa Melayu oleh guru prasekolah berasaskan Model Zemelman dalam Pengajaran Bahasa Melayu. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bitara UPSI*, 16, 179-189.
- Simon, C. C., & Yasin, R. M. (2022). Pelaksanaan pendekatan kaedah edutainment dalam pengajaran dan pembelajaran sekolah-sekolah luar bandar di Sabah. *Jurnal Dunia Pendidikan*, 4(1), 113-126.
- Slavin, R. E (2006). *Educational psychology* (8th edition). Boston: Pearson/Allyn & Bacon.
- Slavin, R. E. (1995). A Model of Effective Instruction. *The Educational Forum*, 59(2), 166–176.
- Slavin, R. E. (2009). *Educational Psychology Theory and Practice*, Eight Edition. Massacushet: Allyn and Bacon Publisher.

- Sowell, J. (2017). Good Instruction-Giving in the Second-Language Classroom. In *English Teaching Forum* (Vol. 55, No. 3, pp. 10-19). US Department of State. Bureau of Educational and Cultural Affairs, Office of English Language Programs, SA-5, 2200 C Street NW 4th Floor, Washington, DC 20037.
- Tanase, M. (2020). Is good teaching culturally responsive?. *Journal of Pedagogical Research*, 4(3), 187-202.
- United Nations. (2021). *The Sustainable Development Goals Report 2021*. New York, USA: United Nations.
- Unjong, P., & Seruji, Z. (2022). Pelaksanaan Didik Hibur dalam pengajaran dan pembelajaran membaca Bahasa Melayu murid LINUS tahun 3. *Asian People Journal (APJ)*, 5(1), 22-30.
- Ahmad, W. N. W. (2019). Amalan guru dalam melaksanakan kemahiran literasi Bahasa Melayu bagi program LINUS di sekolah (Teacher practice in implementation malay language literacy skills for LINUS program in primary school). *Malay Language Education Journal-MyLEJ*, 9(1), 1–11.
- World Bank (2024). *Malaysia Economic Monitor - Bending Bamboo Shoots: Strengthening Foundational Skills*. Washington, DC: The World Bank.
- Xiao, Y., & Watson, M. (2019). Guidance on conducting a systematic literature review. *Journal of planning education and research*, 39(1), 93-112.
- Yunus, H., & Ahmad, N. A. (2019). A conceptual framework for META ProBaca Module in improving reading comprehension and reading fluency among dyslexia pupils. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business & Social Sciences*, 9(11), 1187-1200.
- Yusri, A. A., Zainal, M. Z., & Ismail, I. M. (2024). Pembelajaran berasaskan permainan dalam pengajaran dan pembelajaran Bahasa Melayu: Suatu Tinjauan Literatur. *International Journal of the Malay World and Civilisation* 12(1), 2024: 15 – 26.
- Yusuf, M. S., Shaffeei, K., & Razalli, A. R. (2023). Construction of kits 'Jom Bantu Anak Murid' (JOBA) improve the reading mastery of special recovery students: Pembinaan Kit Jom Bantu Anak Murid (JOBA) meningkatkan penguasaan membaca murid Pemulihan Khas. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bitara UPSI*, 16, 105-122.
- Zairin, S., & Nordin, M. N. (2023). The effectiveness of a multisensory approach in improving open syllabic reading skills of special education needs students (SENS). *Special Education [SE]*, 1(1), e0008-e0008.
- Zakeri, M., & Chemelnezhad, M. (2023). Identifying the components of effective teaching of first grade primary Persian book: A case study of Hormozgan Province. *Iranian Evolutionary and Educational Psychology Journal*, 5(2), 0-0.